



7<sup>th</sup> March, 2018

*via Email*

Regional Freedom of Information Officer  
U.S. EPA, Region V  
77 West Jackson Boulevard (MI-9J)  
Chicago, IL 60604-3590  
(312) 886-6686  
[R5foia@epa.gov](mailto:R5foia@epa.gov)  
[chatfield.ethan@epa.gov](mailto:chatfield.ethan@epa.gov)

**Re: FOIA Request re Consent Decree Compliance Concerns**  
**(*United States v. SIGECO*, No. IP 99-1692 C-M/F)**

Dear Records Custodian,

On behalf of Sierra Club, I am writing to request that the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA") provide copies of the records described below pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act, 5 U.S.C. § 552 ("FOIA"), and the EPA regulations at 40 C.F.R § 2.100, *et seq.* Sierra Club is the nation's oldest environmental organization. It is dedicated to the protection and preservation of the natural and human environment. Sierra Club is committed to solving the pressing environmental and health problems associated with the mining, burning and disposal of coal and its combustion by-products.

**Documents Requested**

On April 11, 2017, Edward Nam of U.S. EPA Region V sent Angila Retherford of Southern Indiana Gas & Electric Company ("SIGECO") a letter addressing compliance concerns regarding certain provisions of the federal consent decree entered in *United States v. SIGECO*, No. IP 99-1692 C-M/F. Ethan Chatfield was listed as the agency's contact person for this letter.

Pursuant to the FOIA, Sierra Club hereby requests a copy of SIGECO's response(s) to this letter.



### **Exempt Records**

Should you decide to invoke a FOIA exemption with regard to any of the requested records, please include in your full or partial denial letter sufficient information for Sierra Club to appeal the denial. To comply with legal requirements, the following information should be included:

1. Basic factual material about each withheld item, including the originator, date, length, general subject matter, and location of each item; and
2. Explanations and justifications for denial, including the identification of the category within the governing statutory provision under which the document (or portion thereof) was withheld and a full explanation of how each exemption fits the withheld material.

If you determine that portions of the record requested are exempt from disclosure, please redact the exempt portions and provide the remainder of the record to Sierra Club at the address listed below.

### **Fee Waiver Request**

I respectfully request that you waive all fees in connection with this request as provided by 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and 40 C.F.R. § 2.107(1). Sierra Club has spent years promoting the public interest through the development of policies that protect human health and the environment, and has routinely received fee waivers under FOIA.

Sierra Club is a national, nonprofit, environmental organization with no commercial interest in obtaining the requested information. Instead, Sierra Club intends to maintain public websites containing the requested information, so the public can access this important information regarding pollution in their communities.

As explained below, this FOIA request satisfies the factors listed in DOE's governing regulations for waiver or reduction of fees, as well as the requirements of fee waiver under the FOIA statute – that “disclosure of the information is in the public interest because it is likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of the operations or activities of the government and is not primarily in the commercial interest of the requester.” 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii), *see also* 40 C.F.R. § 2.107(1).

1. The subject matter of the requested records must specifically concern identifiable “operations and activities of the government.”



These activities denoted in this request are “identifiable operations or activities of the government.” The Department of Justice Freedom of Information Act Guide expressly concedes that “in most cases records possessed by a federal agency will meet this threshold” of identifiable operations or activities of the government. And, in any event, the requested documents relate to EPA enforcement of Clean Air Act requirements, which is an activity of the U.S. government.

2. The disclosure of the requested documents has an informative value and will be “likely to contribute to an understanding of Federal government operations or activities”.

The Freedom of Information Act Guide makes it clear that, in the Department of Justice’s view, the “likely to contribute” determination hinges in substantial part on whether the requested documents provide information that is not already in the public domain. The requested records are “likely to contribute” to an understanding of your agency’s operations or activities because they are not otherwise in the public domain and are not accessible other than through a FOIA request. This information will facilitate meaningful public understanding of EPA’s implementation of Clean Air Act requirements, therefore fulfilling the requirement that the documents requested be “meaningfully informative” and “likely to contribute” to an understanding of your agency’s enforcement of federal environmental statutes and regulations.

3. The disclosure contributes to the understanding of the public at large.

Sierra Club and its members have a longstanding interest and expertise in the subject of Clean Air Regulations and coal-burning and natural gas power plants. Sierra Club unquestionably has the “specialized knowledge” and “ability and intention” to disseminate the information requested in the broad manner outlined above, and to do so in a manner that contributes to the understanding of the “public-at-large.” Sierra Club intends to disseminate the information it receives through FOIA regarding these government operations and activities in a variety of ways, including, but not limited to: analysis and distribution to the media, distribution through publication and mailing, posting on the Club’s website, emailing and list serve distribution to our members across the U.S., and via public meetings and events. Such dissemination will inform the public regarding how EPA goes about implementing Clean Air Act Requirements.

4. The disclosure contributes “significantly” to public understanding of government



operations or activities.

The records requested will contribute “significantly” to the public understanding of the government’s investigatory and enforcement role, and its “operations and activities” associated with Clean Air Act requirements. Further, the disclosure of the requested records is essential to the public’s understanding of the potential impacts of emissions from these Arkansas power plants. After disclosure of these records, the public understanding of the potential impacts of emissions from these activities will be significantly enhanced.

5. Sierra Club has no commercial interest that would be furthered by the requested disclosure.

The Sierra Club has no commercial interest in the requested records. Nor does it have any intention to use these records in any manner that “furthers a commercial, trade, or profit interest” as those terms are commonly understood. The Sierra Club is a tax-exempt organization under sections 501(c)(3) and 501(c)(4) of the Internal Revenue Code, and as such has no commercial interest. The requested records will be used for the furtherance of the Sierra Club’s mission to inform the public on matters of vital importance to the environment and public health.

\* \* \*

**Record Delivery**

In responding to this request, please comply with all relevant deadlines and other obligations set forth in FOIA and the agency’s regulations. 5 U.S.C. § 552 (a)(6)(A)(i); 40 C.F.R. § 2.104. Please produce the records above by sending them to the address listed below. Please produce them on a rolling basis; at no point should the search for – or deliberation concerning – certain records delay the production of others that the agency has already retrieved and elected to produce.

Thank you for your cooperation. If you find that this request is unclear in any way, please do not hesitate to call me to see if I can clarify the request or otherwise expedite and simplify your efforts to comply.



Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Tony Mendoza".

---

Tony Mendoza  
Staff Attorney  
Sierra Club Environmental Law Program  
2101 Webster St., 13th Floor  
Oakland, CA 94612  
(415) 977-5589  
(510) 208-3140 fax  
[tony.mendoza@sierraclub.org](mailto:tony.mendoza@sierraclub.org)